

Methods and Professionalism Review Rubric for Consensus Papers

Review Questions for Consensus Papers	
1.	The article is well-written with few and minor grammar and spelling errors. (NSD / MD / A / E) + Comments
2.	The article is in scope for the Journal (Scientific and Professional Review) (NSD / MD / A / E) + Comments
3.	The consensus paper abstract contains the following sections: introduction and objectives, methods, and a summary of the resulting consensus statements.
4.	The consensus paper contains a methods section in the body of the consensus paper or as an appendix. NOTE: consensus statements are offered as findings obtained through systematic processes. As such, the consensus statements themselves are not subject to peer-review. The methodology description is independently peer-reviewed to assure that the methods are completely and clearly articulated. The following items are to be applied to the Methods section only. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
5.	The consensus paper methods section presents the results of one or more systematic group processes undertaken to achieve consensus. Group processes include but are not limited to activities such as surveys, voting, Delphi processes, nominal group technique, etc. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
6.	The consensus paper methods section states how and why participants were selected including the criteria for deciding the number of participants and their representativeness of the community of practice. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
7.	The consensus paper methods section states whether participants are authors of the paper or research participants. If participants were considered human subjects, review and determination by an appropriate ethics committee such as an Institutional Review Board (IRB) should be described and accompanied by the ethics committee identifier. If both, the criteria for determining participant-authors should be stated. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
8.	The consensus paper methods section states the number and relevant characteristics of participants. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
9.	The consensus paper methods section states the data collection methods used including types of data collected, rationale for data collection methods used, start and stop dates of data collection and analysis, any iterative aspects of data collection and any changes to data collection procedures in response to iterative findings. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
10.	The consensus paper methods section describes instruments or tools used in data collection such as interview guides, question sets, questionnaires, how data from sessions with participants were recorded, and whether and why data collection instruments or tools changed during data collection if there were changes. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments

11. The consensus paper methods section describes data processing including transcription, note taking, data entry, verification, coding, de-identification of data and quoted material. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
12. The consensus paper methods section describes processes by which themes or consensus statements were identified. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
13. The consensus paper methods section describes actions taken to verify and validate the resulting consensus statements such as member-checking, expert review, or public comment and how feedback obtained through these processes was addressed. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
14. The consensus paper methods section states limitations in the methods and their impact on interpretation of the results. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
15. Assertions are original or appropriately cited. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
16. The paper is free from commercial intent and marketing. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
17. Other than the required methods section or methods appendix, there are no required sections for consensus papers. However, relevant section headers should be effectively used to organize the content of the manuscript. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
18. The title, conclusions and recommendations are supported by the content of the consensus paper (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
19. The content of the consensus paper is relevant to practice. (Response Options Plz spell out in drop-down: NSD, MD, A , E) + Comments
20. Reviewer Overall Recommendation (Scientific and Professional Review) (Response Options: Reject / Major Revision / Minor Revision / Accept) + Comments
21. Reviewer comments for improving the Review Process

Methods section criteria were adapted from O'Brien BC, Harris IB, Beckman TJ, Reed DA, Cook DA, Standards for Reporting Qualitative Research A Synthesis of Recommendations Academic Medicine: September 2014 - Volume 89 - Issue 9 - p 1245-1251. doi: 10.1097/ACM.0000000000000388

All but Q12 are required